VOTE NO on HB 2195 (Rep. Mendoza)

Forced DNA Collection Threatens Medical Privacy

HB 2195 would require DNA extraction from all persons arrested for afelony. Current Illinois law draws the line at conviction. 730 ILCS 5/5-4-3.

DNA testing discloses private health information.

- DNA can be used to make predictions about a person's physical and mental health. Thus, it might be used by employers, insurers, and others for invidious genetic discrimination.
- Criminal DNA databases contain non-coding DNA, as opposed to the genes that make up our genetic blueprint. But non-coding DNA often regulates, disrupts, or correlates with genes. *See*, *e.g.*, "'Junk' DNA gets credit for making us who we are," *New Scientist* (3/19/10). Indeed, some of the non-coding DNA in the FBI's DNA system correlates with important genes. *See*, *e.g.*, "Fingerprint fear," *New Scientist* (5/2/01).
- Police often keep all of a tested person's DNA, though only a part goes in the database.
- Illinois limits the uses of its DNA database, 730 ILCS 5/5-4-3(f-5), but these limits might be lifted, and unlawful misuse is always possible.

Forced DNA testing should stop with convicted persons, and not expand to arrested persons.

- Convictions are based on a jury's finding of proof beyond a reasonable doubt after trial. Arrests are fundamentally different, based on a single officer's finding of probable cause. Because of the large number of wrongful arrests, employers cannot discriminate on the basis of an arrest. 775 ILCS 5/2-103.
- The next step down this slippery slope may be other groups with a diminished expectation of privacy, such as public school students, and applicants for government jobs, licenses, and benefits.

HB 2195 would disparately impact people of color, who are arrested – often wrongly – at a higher rate than others. *See, e.g.*, Report of the Illinois Disproportionate Justice Impact Study Commission (12/10).

HB 2195 would cost many millions of dollars per year. Testing often costs \$100 per sample, and tens of thousands of people are arrested but not convicted every year in Illinois.

HB 2195 would overwhelm our state's DNA labs. These labs already face a serious backlog of crime-scene DNA samples. *See*, *e.g.*, "State crime lab reports more than 4,000 untested rape kits," *Chi. Trib.* (1/17/11).

HB 2195 would harm presumably innocent arrested persons.

- Compelled DNA extraction, especially if forcible, is physically invasive.
- Illinois DNA records are shared with local, state, and federal agencies across the country. This massive dissemination creates a danger of wrongful disclosure of private medical information.
- Expungement provides no protection during the months or years between arrest and acquittal.

HB 2195 would be unconstitutional.

- Courts have held that compelled DNA testing of arrestees violates the U.S. Constitution. *Friedman v. Boucher*, 580 F.3d 847 (9th Cir. 2009); *U.S. v. Mitchell*, 681 F. Supp. 2d 597 (W.D. Pa. 2009); *U.S. v. Purdy*, 205 WL 3465721 (D. Neb. 2005); *In re C.T.L.*, 722 N.W.2d 484 (Minn. App. Ct. 2006).
- The Privacy Clause of the Illinois Constitution provides even stronger protection from forced bodily testing than the U.S. Constitution. *In re May 1991 Will County Grand Jury*, 152 Ill. 2d 381 (1992).

HB 2195 is not justified by possible exonerations. Innocent suspects will volunteer their own DNA for testing, and a non-match with the crime-scene DNA will tend to prove innocence. *People v. Dodds*, 801 N.E.2d 63, 71-72 (III. App. Ct. 2003) (a non-match required a post-conviction evidentiary hearing). Convictions despite non-matches indicate serious problems with our criminal justice system, which cannot be solved by HB 2195.

